

Daf Hashvuah Gemara and Tosfos Beitza Daf 32
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
Tosfos.ecwid.com
Subscribe free or Contact: tosfosproject@gmail.com

The Gemara asks: do the Rabanan argue regarding tying up a door attached to the ground? After all, we have a Braisa that they agree to R' Meir that you can untie them on Shabbos but not unwind and cut. You can untie, unwind and cut on Yom Tov.

Daf 32a

The Gemara answers that Shmuel is saying like the following Tanna: you can only untie ropes tying doors attached to the ground but you can't unwind and cut. This applies both by Shabbos and by Yom Tov. You can only untie ropes tying a utensil, but you can't unwind and cut on Shabbos, but you can untie, unwind and cut on Yom Tov.

The Gemara asks: this answers the first part (that it's always forbidden if attached to the ground) but how would you answer the second part (since Shmuel allowed unwinding and cutting by utensils on Shabbos).

The Gemara answers: that Braisa is like R' Nechemia who says all utensils can only be moved for their regular use, (therefore, you can't move a knife to cut rope, since it's not its regular use. However, we don't Paskin like him, so Shmuel can argue on this point.)

The Gemara asks: if it's R' Nechemia, then he shouldn't allow on Yom Tov too. If you want to say that R' Nechemia differentiates by this rabbinical prohibition between Shabbos and Yom Tov, this is not true. After all, we have one Braisa which says that you can make a fire (by using for fuel) both utensils and broken utensils. Another Braisa allows both with utensils and with broken utensils, and another Braisa forbids both. We reconcile them by saying, the first is R' Yehuda (who forbids utensils broken today since it's Muktzah because of Nolad). The second one is R' Shimon (who doesn't hold of Muktzah so he allows even those that broke today). The third one is R' Nechemia (who held you can't move utensils to get burnt since it's not its regular use. So we see that R' Nechemia forbids this on Yom Tov.)

The Gemara answers: there is a Tannaic argument what R' Nechemia held regarding Yom Tov.

New Sugya

You can't make an indentation in (clay to form a) lamp since you're making a utensil. You can't make charcoal nor cut a wick. R' Yehuda allows to cut a wick with fire.

Tosfos brings Rashi to explain making the indentation: to take one of the unformed (balls of clay) and stick your fist into it so that you'll carve out the lamp's receptacle, which is making a utensil.

Tosfos asks: if so, then it should be simple that it's forbidden. After all, even though you're not completing a utensil, it's forbidden to start making a utensil.

Another question: why did the Gemara ask when does it start being susceptible to Tumah because it becomes a utensil? After all, since it's before the baking of the pottery, so it has a status as a mud utensil that's never susceptible (until it's baked and becomes earthenware).

Therefore, Tosfos explains "not making an indentation": that they used to put straw or something else into the airspace of the receptacle before baking in order to keep the structure of that airspace during baking that the walls wouldn't collapse and close up the airspace. After baking a little bit, you remove the utensil from the kiln and remove the straw. This is what it means don't make the indentation, i.e., that you can't remove the item in the receptacle, since this is the finishing touches on the utensil. However, since it's standard to return the utensil to the kiln to bake it well, the Gemara asks: who's the one who holds that making this indentation makes it a finished utensil, and answers that it's R' Meir. He holds that it's susceptible to Tumah as soon as you remove the item inside it even though you didn't return it to the kiln. So, it must be that he holds this to be the finishing of the utensil. However, R' Yehoshua says "when you bake it," which means that it's not a utensil until you return it to the kiln and bake it completely. (Therefore, removing the straw is not completing the utensil) and therefore, it's permitted on Yom Tov.

The Gemara asks: who's the Tanna that holds it has a status of being a utensil when indented? R' Yosef answers: it's R' Meir. As we see a Braisa; when is an earthenware utensil susceptible to Tumah? R' Meir says: from the time you finished making it (even without baking it). R' Yehoshua says when you bake it in a kiln.

Abaya asked: how do you know that R' Meir would agree here? Over there, with a regular large earthenware utensil, (although you can't put liquids in it), it can still hold solid things. However, (by a small lamp), what can it hold? The Gemara answers: it can hold coins.

Others bring a version: R' Yosef says the Mishna is R' Eliezer b. Tzadok. As we learned: the Tanna Kama says; 'Charanus' plates (we'll explain that they're country ones) are Tahor from receiving Tumah from being in a tent with a corpse but Tamai when a Zav lifts them, and R' Elazar b. Tzadak holds that they're not even susceptible to a Zav carrying them since they haven't finished being made into a utensil.

Tosfos brings Rashi's explanation: that these are plates made in the country. They don't care much for having nice utensils (as long as they function). So as soon as you have the earthenware vessel in its flat form (before chiseling out a middle) and baking it in the kiln (it has the status of a vessel). Therefore, they're not susceptible to Tumah from the tent of a corpse since it doesn't have any receptacle (which is the only way Tumah can enter an earthenware utensil). However, it receives Tumah from the Zav carrying. As we learn from "which you touched an earthenware vessel," what type of touching is considered as if you touched the whole utensil, this is moving it (since your moving effects every inch of the utensil). Therefore, you don't need it to have a receptacle.

Tosfos asks: if the utensil doesn't have a receptacle, how can it become Tamai by moving it? After all, the rule is: if you can't make it Tamai by touching it, then it can't become Tamai by moving it either.

Rather, Tosfos explains: this plate does have a receptacle, but it's covered (with a layer of earthenware) above the receptacle, and it's made to break through and open up the receptacle. However, the country people don't care and they eat on it without opening up. Therefore, it's not susceptible to Tumah from a corpse, since a well-covered earthenware utensil doesn't get Tamai from a

corpse (since the Tumah can't seep into the receptacle). However, it still becomes Tamai by a Zav carrying it since it's made to be open (so we consider that it could become Tamai by touch when it's opened). As we see that well-covered earthenware utensils do become Tamai by carrying, as the Gemara says by them; we're afraid that his Nida wife might move it, and we say that it protects from Tumah in a tent of a corpse, but it doesn't protect when a woman carried it within twenty-four hours before seeing her period (where we decreed her to be Tamai like a Nida).

Abaya asked: how do you know that R' Eliezer b. Tzadok would agree here? Over there, with a regular large earthenware utensil (after their receptacles are chiseled out and before baking, although you can't put liquids in it), it can still hold solid things. However, (by a small lamp), what can it hold? The Gemara answers: it can hold coins.

We learned: you can't indent a lamp and you can't make 'Charanus' plates on Yom Tov, and R' Shimon b. Gamliel allows making the plates. What are 'Charanus?' 'Irnus.' And what are 'Irnus'? Abaya answers: they're country plates.

The Mishna continues that you can't make charcoal. The Gemara asks: this should be simple, because there are no uses for it on Yom Tov anyhow. R' Chiya taught that they're useful to hand them over to the bathhouse attendants to heat up the bathhouse. The Gemara asks: is that permitted on Yom Tov? (After all, you can't bathe or do anything there on Yom Tov.)

The Gemara answers: the same way Rav answered someplace else, it refers to sweating in the bathhouse in a time before they enacted against people sweating in bathhouses on Yom Tov, so too we can answer here.

Daf 32b **New Sugya**

(On R' Yehuda that you can't cut a wick regularly, but only with fire.) The Gemara asks: why is cutting with a knife forbidden? Because it's making a utensil (wicks). So too cutting the wicks with fire is making a utensil.

R' Chiya taught: we refer to cutting the wicks by putting both heads of the wick in different lamps and lighting the middle (which only looks like you're lighting two lamps and not making wicks).

R' Nosson b. Abba says that you can 'Mochet' a wick. The Gemara asks what's 'Mochatin?' The Gemara answers: removing the ash on top of the wick.

Bar Kapara says: they say six Halachos by wicks, three are stringent and three are lenient. The stringent laws: you can't roll a wick, you can't singe it (to make it easier to light), and you can't cut it in two. The lenient laws: you're allowed to make the wick by pressing the material together, you can soak it in oil, and you may cut it in half by fire when the heads were placed in a different lamp.

Rav said; the rich people of Baval will go down the Gehenim. As in the case where Shabsi b. Murnos went to Baval. He requested that they should give him some wares to sell, and no one did. He finally asked for some food, and no one gave him. He concluded that these people must be the descendants of the Eiruv Rav. As the Pasuk says "I'll give you mercy so you'll have mercy." All those who have mercy on others is a sign that they're descendants of Avraham Avinu. If they don't, then you know they're not his descendants.

Rav also said: someone who needs to look onto other's tables to feed him, the world is dark before him, as the Pasuk says "he wanders for bread. Where is it? He knows that a day of darkness is coming to him." R' Chisda remarked: also, his life is not a true life. We learned: the Tanna Kama says that there are three people whose lives aren't true lives: if he looks onto other's tables to feed him, if his wife rules over him, and someone that has infliction ravage him. Others say to include someone who only owns one piece of clothing. (After all, he can't wash it and he'll have lice.) The Tanna Kama (who doesn't list this) holds that he can still inspect his clothing (daily) from lice.

New Sugya

Someone can't break a shard from earthenware or rip paper in order to roast a salted fish on it. You don't shovel out foreign objects from ovens, but you just press the ash down (in order that there should be room to bake there without having it touch the ash or oven's roof and get singed). You can't set up two barrels next to each other in order to put a pot between them (and have the fire below between the barrels to cook the pot). You can't support a pot (to save it from tipping over) with a log, and the same to a door. You can't lead an animal with a staff on Yom Tov and R' Shimon b. Elazar permits.

The Gemara asks: why can't you (break the shard or rip the paper)? The Gemara answers: since you're making them into a utensil.

On what we said that you can't shovel an oven, R' Chiya b. Yosef taught a Braisa before R' Nachman; if you can't bake without shoveling out, it's permitted. There was a story with the R' Chiya's wife, where a brick fell into the oven (she was planning to bake in) on Yom Tov. Her husband, R' Chiya, said: see to it that I have good bread (that won't be singed, so remove the brick so you'll have ample room to bake the bread). Rava told his attendant: roast for me a goose, and be careful that it doesn't get singed (i.e., shovel the ash).

Raveina asked R' Ashi: I heard from R' Acha of Hutzal that you sealed up your oven's door on Yom Tov (to insulate it). How did you do it? (After all, how did you knead the cement to seal it?)

He answered: we rely on the mud on the banks of the Euphrates. However, that's only permitted if you marked off where you'll take it (so it would be prepared and not Muktzah). Raveina says: you can seal off the oven with ash.

Tosfos quotes Rashi: you can even pour water and knead the ash, since they're not objects that are applicable to real kneading.

Tosfos asks: we say in Mesechtas Shabbos that even pouring water on ash is Chayiv for kneading (because it's not applicable to do regular kneading by it). As it says there "one person places the ash and one pours the water, the latter one is always Chayiv."

Tosfos answers: we refer to sealing off cracks in the oven to insulate the heat with dry ash without adding water. Alternatively, we refer to a case where you poured water on it before Yom Tov, which we permit to apply on Yom Tov without doing anything that has the status of kneading.

New Sugya

R' Nachman allows to plant bathroom stones firmly in the ground on Yom Tov. (They placed the stones apart to have a hollow area for a toilet seat.) Rabbah asked him: didn't our Mishna not even allow placing two barrels next to each other to place a pot on top? R' Nachman answered: there it's different, since you're making a tent (by having the pot as a roof). The small Rabbah asked R' Ashi: if so, could you build a seat (out of bricks and mortar) on Yom Tov, since it doesn't have a roof to be a tent? He answered: the Torah only forbade making permanent structures, but not temporary ones. The Rabanan decreed to forbid making a temporary structure for, perhaps, you'll might come to make a permanent structure. However, (by the bathroom), they permitted (the rabbinical decree of) a temporary structure because of human dignity.

R' Yehuda says: you can build a bonfire (by having a structure of logs) if you build it from top to bottom and not from bottom to top. (I.e., you must hold the top layer in the air and to slip the bottom layer under it and then lower the top layer on it.) The same applies to eggs (placed on a grill), pots (placed on barrels), a bed (when assembled) and piling barrels.

Tosfos explains: you can't build bottom up because it's the regular way of building.

Tosfos asks: how can we set up a table these days by placing a tabletop without legs on top of benches (to be used as legs), by placing down the benches first and then putting the tabletop on top of them?

Tosfos answers: since they don't have walls surrounding the tabletop, it's permitted. All the cases we brought involves the roof item is surrounded by walls that reach the ground.

Tosfos asks: the Mishna in Shabbos allows returning a pot to the top of a stove (which was made of walls that surrounds the fire and open on top where there is a place to put a pot), which the Gemara says, the one who allows returning the pot allows it on Shabbos. (So, how can you cover the walls with a pot and not transgress this prohibition to make a roof for walls?)

Tosfos answers: all these cases that we forbid is where you're making the walls and roof at the same time. However, if you're only making a roof (to existing walls) it's permitted. So, the stove's walls were already made from before, (so it's permitted).

We see that R' Chananel seems to hold like this, since he explains the case of the eggs, that he had a layer of eggs surrounding an area, place one egg on top of them and place the fire (to roast them, in the airspace below. This is not like how Rashi explains it, that you place the eggs on a grill, since it doesn't have walls, it's not similar to building (to prohibit). Therefore, it seems the correct explanation as we already explained above. Also, the case of a bed, doesn't refer to our types of beds that don't have walls on their sides, but these beds had walls.

Tosfos asks: the Gemara in Shabbos says that you can't cover a barrel with a tarp, although the walls of the barrel were already made.

Tosfos answers: that's different since the mouth of the barrel was extremely wide (even if the walls were already made), it resembles making a tent.

Rashi explains that this R' Yehuda holds like R' Yehuda who forbids Muktzah and unintended Melachos (so he forbids these cases even though your intention is not to make a tent). However, we hold like R' Shimon (who would permit these cases because) he permits unintended Melachos.

However, Tosfos says it's forced to say all these Halachos are not like R' Shimon. Therefore, it seems that R' Shimon admits that these cases are forbidden. He only says that unintended Melachos are permitted only if you never intended to do that action (like if you only intended to drag a bench and a furrow was made). However, here he intended to make this structure.